Reviewer's report

Title: Antioxidant effect of gallic acid from Phyllanthus emblica extract prevents contrast-induced acute kidney injury

Version: 1
Date: 1 February 2014

Reviewer: Ajith A.TH. T.A

Reviewer's report:

Comments to Author:

Adis Tasanarong in this MS evaluated the antioxidant effect of the extract from Phyllanthus emblica (PE) in preventing CIAKI. PE extract (125 or 250 or 500 mg/kg/day) for 5 days before the induction of CI-AKI pretreatment with PE extract provides the renal protective effect against CI-AKI in rat model. The findings suggest that pretreatment with PE extract provides the renal protective effect against CI-AKI in rat model and needs further development to assess its clinical usefulness. According to the reviewer this MS failed a large extent due to the following reasons.

1. The title of the MS does not correlate to the content as well as the objective of this study.

2. The objective of this study does not have any novelty. Since it is well known that the extract of Phyllanthus emblica has a wide range of activities due to its antioxidant activity. The authors have stated that ‘Active extracts of PE have been shown to posses anticancer [14, 15], radioprotection [16], anti-inflammatory [17] and antioxidant [18, 19] properties in several models of organ injury’ in this MS. Further, as stated in the introduction “CM induced AKI is more prevalent in subjects with chronic renal impairment or diabetes mellitus’. Instead of a diabetic animals, authors selected normal healthy rat to prove the protection is not the appropriate experimental model.

3. The selection of three doses is not justified in the MS.

4. Presence of high concentrations of acorbic acid, gallic acid, and mixture of phenolic compounds in this extract is established previously.

5. The dosage of the CM used in this study does not correlated to the human toxicity.

6. PE extract at doses of 250 and 500 mg/kg/day markedly suppressed renal tubular injuries. However, the data does not support this. There are no dose dependent protections found among the groups treated with theses doses (Fig.2 - BUN and Creatinine values are consistently over lapping in these 2 groups).
7. No reference standard used to standardize the results.

8. No attempt is made in this MS to evaluate the interference of this extract with the CM.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

Reviewer declares that there are no competing interests in this paper.