Reviewer’s report

Title: The Selective Cytotoxic Anti Cancer Properties and Proteomic Analysis of Trigonella Foenum-Graecum

Version: 4 Date: 3 October 2013

Reviewer: Sreemoyee Chaterjee

Reviewer’s report:

Reviewer’s report: Major compulsory revisions:
The present manuscript aimed at investigating the anticancer effect of Trigonella and its proteomics profile. Results showed significant cytotoxic effect both on the human body and on human cell lines. The result of the study is in accordance with the objective however at some places it needs justification.

i. Background: what is the concentration (8mg/----ml or L??) that is given to the patient as it just mentions the amount? Why specifically 8mg? Is the dose enough to cure such a fatal disease?

‘The approximate daily amount was 8 mg of fenugreek seeds, and they continued the treatment for 6 months’

ii. Authors have mentioned selective cytotoxic effects in the title. What is the implication of the word Selective? Is it necessary to use the word or the title without it also renders the same meaning?

iii. Some typing and spelling errors are there:

Methods Cell Viability Assay: 3-(4, 5-dimethylthazol-2-yl)-2,5 diphenyletrazlium bromide (MMT)-assay (it is MTT assay)and 370C It should be 370C. The Scientific name i.e. Trigonella should be in Italics under the title background. In vitro should be in italics under the heading conclusion before the heading background.

Provide the rationale for specifically studying the limited dose range of the fenugreek seed extract.

iv. Why in the present study lethal dose/ tolerance study for the fenugreek seed extracts were not carried out?

v. Has the author used any standard drug to compare the results and to plot the graph?? There is no standard graph and IC50 information.

vi. There is no heading like Materials used wherein the author can mention plant material, cell lines used etc.

vii. Provide the rationale for specifically choosing the concentration of the fenugreek seed extract.

Methods: Apoptosis analysis by Annexin-V staining: The applied fenugreek extract was reconstituted in sterile water to yield the desired concentration of 300ug/ml. Provide a reference if required.
viii. Discussion part: median survival is 13.5, 22 months. What does the author mean by 13.5 and 22 months? The statement is in itself unclear.

ix. What is the basis of choosing water as a vehicle/solvent for the drug extract preparation?
   Mention proper reference.

x. What is the relevance of conducting protein profile?? How is it related to the anticancer effect?

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

NO COMPETING INTEREST.