Reviewer's report

Title: Effects of Ginkgo biloba on chemically-induced mammary tumors in rats receiving tamoxifen

Version: 2 Date: 8 February 2013

Reviewer: Jiaren liu

Reviewer's report:

Dias, MC, et al reported that Ginkgo biloba(GbE) with tamoxifen(TAM) or only TAM could decrease PCNA LI% within live tumor areas, the proportions of live and necrotic areas of mammary tumor in a SD rat model induced by 7,12-dimethylbenz(a)anthracene (DMBA). But GbE also significantly increased the proportion of degenerative areas of mammary tumor compared to the only TAM group. This manuscript is very interesting. But there are should be clear these questions:

1. Authors divided female SD rats bearing palpable mammary tumors (> 1 cm in diameter) into 4 groups and given different treatment Control, TAM, TAM with GbE. Before the beginning of treatments, all animals bearing palpable tumors were submitted to excision biopsies to evaluate the histopathological pattern of PCNA and cleaved-caspase-3, estrogen receptor (ER-) and p63. These data were mammary tumors which were before treatments. My concerns are about how about the data of after treatments. Had these rats new mammary tumors during 4-week treatment? If yes, authors should supply new data after treatment.

2. As table 1, there had 7 tumors in control, 11 in TAM, etc. It seems new tumors in the rats. Authors should give the information about how many rats in each group and how many tumors each rat.

3. About expression of cell proliferation, apoptosis and ER- and p63 in mammary tumor, authors should have the data of statistical analysis.

4. Figure 4 should be cleaved-caspase-3.

Level of interest: An article of insufficient interest to warrant publication in a scientific/medical journal

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.