Reviewer's report

Title: Antimicrobial constituents of three Cameroonian medicinal plants: Garcinia nobilis, Oricia suaveolens and Balsamocitrus camerunensis

Version: 2 Date: 21 September 2012

Reviewer: Khalid Hussain

Reviewer's report:

The main points for the authors are given as follows:
1- The results have been expressed as percentage of the total bacteria for example (inhibitory effects being noted against 85.7% of the 14 tested bacteria, line 45 and 46). The statement is ambiguous. The inhibition needs to be expressed in concentration.

2- Line 46, 47 and 48 GNB also exhibited the best activity against M. tuberculosis ATCC 27294 strain (MIC of 128 µg/ml) and the Gram-negative Escherichia coli ATCC10536 (MIC of 64 µg/ml) 48 than the extracts from O. suaveolens and B. camerunensis.

(It should be as extracts of GNB exhibited better anti-TB and antibacterial activity as compared to that of the extracts of ...........)  

3- Line 49 compound 2 was isolated from the most GNB?

4- Line 53 and 54 the effects of the best ones being also observed 78.6% of the tested bacteria for the xanthone, morusignin I (5) and the alkaloid, kokusaginine (13)

(Needs to be clarified)

5- Line 231 sentence should not be started with figure (100 µl)

6- Line 274 and 275 The compounds were isolated from the stem bark of G. nobilis (1-5), the woods of O. suaveolens (6-11), the roots (12-17)?, and the 275 stem bark of B. camerunensis (7, 18-22).

7- Line 298 Inhibitory activity being recorded on 12 of the 14 (85.7%) tested bacteria.

8- Line 301 The inhibitory effect of OSR and OSW from O suaveolens were observed on 9/14 (64.3%) and 7/14 (50.0%) of the studied bacteria respectively, meanwhile that of BCB (B. camerunensis extract) was observed on 4/14 (50.0%).?

9- Line 340 their antimicrobial propertie.? 

10- Line 348 and 349 demonstrated that compounds 3 [38] and 16 [39] have a low antibacterial activity, and this is also confirm herein.

The major concern
In the introduction authors need to the previous antibacterial reports on the
extracts/isolated compounds of the three plants. And on what bases they have selected bark of one plant and wood of the other etc.