Reviewer's report

Title: Physicochemical and antioxidant properties of Malaysian monofloral honey

Version: 1 Date: 11 December 2012

Reviewer: Patricia Vit

Reviewer's report:

Title: Physicochemical and antioxidant properties of Malaysian monofloral honey

Type of article: Research article

Authors:
Mohammed Moniruzzaman
Md. Ibrahim Khalil
Siti Amrah Sulaiman
Siew Hua Gan

Compulsory revision
1. Is the question posed by the authors well defined? YES
2. Are the methods appropriate and well described? YES, some comments are done, and can be easily corrected.
3. Are the data sound? YES, but needs to be re-organized as bee origin since monofloral origin was not confirmed by melissopalynological analysis, and tualang honey is not monoflora but multifloral.
4. Does the manuscript adhere to the relevant standards for reporting and data deposition? YES. Many analysis were done, and some units need to be checked. For the acacia honey, authors provide one geographic origin (Borneo). They should also inform the other location where the second acacia honey was produced.
5. Are the discussion and conclusions well balanced and adequately supported by the data? YES.
6. Are limitations of the work clearly stated? Could be improved.
This is a preliminary study and hopefully more honeys will be collecteed and analyzed in future. We need at least 30 honeys of each type, and Malaysia has such a diversity of bees and plants originating honey.
7. Do the authors clearly acknowledge any work upon which they are building, both published and unpublished? YES, to confirm the entomological origin would be also advisable to send samples of the bees to an entomologist. Considering this is a tradition to keep the three species of bees, would be sufficient to
acknowledge in detail persons and institutions, city, who provided the analyzed honeys.

8. Do the title and abstract accurately convey what has been found? A modified title is strongly suggested, and derived modifications along the text need to be made by the authors

Physicochemical and antioxidant properties of Malaysian monofloral honey produced by Apis cerana, Apis dorsata and Apis mellifera

I suggest to modify the title, so the three entomological origins of Malaysian honey are more visible. To do so, is better to delete monofloral although two acacia honeys and one pineapple honey should be monofloral… To strictly name a monofloral honey, authors would need melissopalynological analysis. Let us assume they do not have the facilities. Therefore, it is advised to find a collaborator for next research to confirm the monofloral origin of honey.

9. Is the writing acceptable? YES, minor editing was suggested in the attached manuscript.

Discretionary addition If possible add one "kelulut" Tetragonisca sp. honey. If not possible leave it for another research including botanical and geographic origin.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'