Reviewer’s report

Title: Norartocarpetin from a folk medicine Artocarpus communis plays a melanogenesis inhibitor without cytotoxicity and skin irritation in mice

Version: 2 Date: 23 May 2013

Reviewer: Léocadie KAMAGAJU

Reviewer’s report:

Please find below my comments after reviewing the manuscript: Norartocarpetin from a folk medicine Artocarpus communis plays a melanogenesis inhibitor without cytotoxicity and skin irritation in mice"

Major Compulsory Revisions

1. Rephrase the title to make it more clear, it looks like the inhibition of melanogenesis, cytotoxicity and skin irritation are all done in mice.

2. For all plants in your paper, give full identification (ex. Artocarpus communis Forst. Or Artocarpus communis J.R.Forst. & G.Forst. Moraceae)

3. Background: you say: “Natural products used in preventive medicine have also been developed as cosmeceutical ingredients in skin care products”. Generalization, I do not think that all plants used in preventive medicine have developed as cosmeceutical ingredients in skin, if it is in your country, please specify. If it is in others country, please give references.

“Norartocarpetin is one of the antioxidant and antityrosinase activity compound in Artocarpus communis; however, the cytotoxicity, skin irritation and antimelanogenesis mechanisms of norartocarpetin ……….”. Tyrosinase is the key enzyme of melanogenesis, its inhibition means the melanogenesis inhibition, if tyrosinase inhibition was studied, where the foundation of your work? what is the novelty of your work?

4. For different inhibition tests, what is the positive control (a product known as tyrosinase inhibitor, for example)?

5. P7: why do you describe the methods only and not the material?

6. Describe the cell lines used

7. Be sure to check the figures legend; ex. Fig 3A and B is not “The cellular melanin (A) and tyrosinase activity (B) of norartocarpetin in B16F10 cells but inhibition of cellular melanin (A) and tyrosinase activity (B) of norartocarpetin in B16F10 cells.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests' below.