Author's response to reviews

Title: In vitro anti-mycobacterial activity of nine medicinal plants used by ethnic groups in Sonora, Mexico

Authors:

Adriana Garibay-Escobar (agaribay@guayacan.uson.mx)
Ramón-Enrique Robles Zepeda (rrobles@guayacan.uson.mx)
Enrique-Wenceslao Coronado-Aceves (enriquew.coronadoa@a2004.uson.mx)
Carlos Velázquez-Contreras (velaz@guayacan.uson.mx)
Eduardo Ruiz-Bustos (erbustos@guayacan.uson.mx)
Moisés Navarro-Navarro (moisesn@guayacan.uson.mx)

Version: 5 Date: 23 October 2013

Author's response to reviews: see over
Author’s response to Associate Editors comments

TITLE:

In vitro anti-mycobacterial activity of nine medicinal plants used by ethnic groups in Sonora, México

AUTHORS:

Ramón Enrique Robles-Zepeda; Enrique Wenceslao Coronado-Aceves; Carlos Arturo Velázquez-Contreras; Eduardo Ruiz-Bustos; Moisés Navarro-Navarro; Adriana Garibay-Escobar.

Ramón Enrique Robles-Zepeda (rrobles@guayacan.uson.mx)

Enrique Wenceslao Coronado-Aceves (enriquew.coronadoa@a2004.uson.mx)

Carlos Arturo Velázquez-Contreras (velaz@guayacan.uson.mx)

Eduardo Ruiz-Bustos (erbustos@guayacan.uson.mx)

Moisés Navarro-Navarro (moisesn@guayacan.uson.mx)

Adriana Garibay-Escobar (agaribay@guayacan.uson.mx)
Dear Dr. Tom Rowles,

I received the Associate Editor comments (20130825) regarding the manuscript that we sent for publication in BMC Complementary and Alternative Medicine (Manuscript, MS: 1284775545910449, entitled “In vitro antimycobacterial activity of nine medicinal plants used by ethnic groups in Sonora, Mexico”).

We have responded to all comments raised by the Associated Editor comments, and we hope that our improved revised manuscript is now suitable for publication in your prestigious journal.

The modified parts of the paper are highlighted in bold-face type and are aimed at clarifying issues raised by the Associate Editor.

I look forward to your reply and final decision.

Sincerely yours,

Dr. Adriana Garibay-Escobar
Professor
Department of Chemistry-Biology
University of Sonora
E-mail: agaribay@guayacan.uson.mx
Associate Editor comments:

1. The style and grammar in my opinion is still below this journal standard.
   - The style and grammar was revised.

2. Although authors made an effort to respond to previous comments, they did not attend to all the comments. In another case, the response given (by adding certain sentences) disrupts the flow as well as the clarity of the thought being expressed (see pages 9-10). For example, consider my previous comment that "Authors implied more than one plant by saying ?those plants whose methanol extracts exhibited antimycobacterial activity at < 200 ?g/mL?? whereas it was only one plant species that they did this for". This has not been attended to (see page 7, first paragraph).
   - All the comments were attended and included in the manuscript.

3. Also, my previous comment relating to the title and column subheading of Table 3 (in relation to Baljet reaction has not been attended to. The use of undefined abbreviation such as SQLs in a Table title is not acceptable
   - The abbreviation SQLs was replaced by sesquiterpene lactones in subheading of Table 3.

4. Another observation is that the species Schinus molle is no longer in Table 2.
   - Shinus molle was included in Table 2.

5. In the Reference list, scientific names should be written in italics.
   - This was corrected

6. The format of this journal in using standard journal abbreviation was not followed.
   - This was corrected

7. As previously pointed out, the limitation of this study vis-à-vis the plant part traditionally used and the parts tested in this study must be clearly stated (even in the conclusion).
   - This was included in manuscript (results, discussion, and conclusion)