Author's response to reviews

Title: Antibacterial and anti-inflammatory effects of Syzygium jambos L. (Alston) and isolated compounds on acne vulgaris

Authors:
Richa Sharma (richajangid5@gmail.com)
Navneet Kishore (kishore.navneet6@gmail.com)
Ahmed A Hussein (ahmohammed@uwc.ac.za)
Namrita Lall (Namrita.Lall@up.ac.za)

Version: 2 Date: 3 October 2013

Author’s response to reviews:

As per your suggestions we have attended to all the Reviewer’s comments as explained below:

Reviewer’s comments:
Reviewer: Gerhard Prinsloo

Minor essential revisions
1. Include the compound names for C1-C6 constantly throughout the document.
In some cases only the name is supplied and in other cases only C, even in figure 1 (examples on pages 3, 5, 15, 16, 17)
Answer: The names of all six compounds (C1-C6) have been added throughout the document except, under heading “Extraction and purification” where they are addressed as compound 1, 2 and 3 (as their identity not revealed yet). Their names are mentioned for the first time when their identity is discussed in “Results and discussions” under the heading “Identification of isolated compounds”. After this, they are named throughout.

2. Na and Nt should be explained in table 1 for clarity purpose
Answer: Na and Nt have been explained on page 26 and 27

Discretionary revisions
1. The conclusion is an anti-climax to the manuscript. The importance of the research, the possible impact, the limitations and future for this research could have been explored in more detail and presented to put the significance of the results in perspective.
Answer: The conclusions are revised as per Reviewer’s suggestions. The importance of research and future perspective are discussed in the conclusions. The future plans of clinical studies are included.

Editor’s comments:
Minor Essential Revisions
1. Paragraph 4 under Background: These fatty acids act as chemokines and increases the release......; Follicular wall ruptures due to the action of hydrolytic enzyme causes
Answer:
Changed from- These fatty acids act as chemokines and increases the release
To- These fatty acids act as chemokines and increase the release
Changed from- Follicular wall ruptures due to the action of hydrolytic enzymes which
cause oxidative
To- Follicular wall ruptures due to the action of hydrolytic enzyme causes
2. Second last sentence under Extraction and purification: MF 6 (1.4 g) was subjected to column ....;
Answer:
Changed from- MF 6 (1.4 g) was subjected column ....;
To- MF 6 (1.4 g) was subjected to column ....;
3. a) Second sentence under Identification of isolated compounds: The compounds isolated from the ethanol extract of leaves of ...
Answer:
Changed from- isolated from leaves of ethanol extract of S. jambos
To- isolated from the ethanol extract of leaves of S. jambos
(b) sixth sentence : ... also supported the presence of six carbons and a carboxylic group constituting the backbone, although a few signals indicating the presence of long aliphatic chain ...
Answer: The full stop is removed and a comma is added between two sentences.
4. Second paragraph, first sentence: The present study ... ursolic acid and an analogue of ...
Answer: The word “an” is added in front of analogue of....
5. The first sentence under Antibacterial bioassay: The MIC value of the ethanol extract of S. jambos ...
Answer: The word “of” is added before S. jambos
6. Under Figures, Figure 2: 9a) untreated bacteria,
Answer: “bacterias” change to “bacteria”
Discretionary Revisions
1. Compounds C4, C5 & C6:
Abstracts (Results, 1st sentence): The authors mention that they extracted three compounds, C1 – C3 but continue to report about C4 – C6. This causes a confusion, perhaps they can rename these other compounds so that it is clear they were not isolated from the plant. In sentence number 10, the authors state that the compounds were added on the basis that these compounds were identified from the plant before. They should at least have confirmed their presence even by TLC before including them. Last paragraph under Conclusion: The authors draw conclusions that the compounds may contribute towards antibacterial activity even though their presence in the extract has not been confirmed. The authors can either do a quick confirmation by TLC or leave them out of the conclusion.

Answer: In abstract, all the compounds are properly named and C1-C6 naming in removed. For all commercially acquired compounds, it has been stated in brackets as “(commercially acquired)” to avoid any confusion.

Also, the presence of three commercially bought compounds was confirmed by TLC and is stated on page 11, first paragraph, last sentence.

In conclusion, the changes are done as per Reviewer (Gerhard Prinsloo) and unnecessary description of compounds is removed.

Thanks and Regards

Namrita Lall