Author's response to reviews

Title: Investigation on flavonoid composition and anti free radical potential of Sida cordata

Authors:

Naseer Ali Shah (drnaseeralishah@gmail.com)
Muhammad Rashid Khan (mrkhangau@yahoo.com)
Bushra Ahmad (Bushra_ahmad04@yahoo.com)
Rahmat Ali Khan (Rahmatgul_81@yahoo.com)
Farah Noureen (Farah_noreen@ymail.com)
Umbreen Rashid (umbreen.rashid@gmail.com)

Version: 2 Date: 22 July 2013

Author's response to reviews:

Dear editor

In response to the reviewers report for the manuscript MS: 8056683209368355 - Phytochemical investigation and anti free radical potential of Sida cordata: A silent herbal drug, changes are made. Point to point modification is listed in front of reviewer analysis in red color.

Yours sincerely

Dr Muhammad Rashid Khan

Reviewer 1

Minor Essential Revisions

Once the Sida cordata that is the botanical name is written as it is then the next time it must be written as S. cordata every time in the whole manuscript according to nomenclature rule.

Followed

Reviewer 2

1- The aim of this study is not clear as appear in the last paragraph of the background.

Changes done to clarify the objective.

2- In the materials and methods, delete all the qualitative analysis (Alkaloids, saponine, terpenoids, anthraquinons, cardiac glycosides, coumarins, phlobatannins, flavonoids, and tannins).

Qualitative analysis is excluded from manuscript.

3- Results and discussion should be combind.
Results and discussion are made combined
4- delete qualitative analysis and Table 1.
deleted
5- Fig. 2 is not clear
Figure 2 is excluded following another reviewer suggestion and only results are described.
Reviewer 3
1. Language needs modifications i.e. Blood was collected directly by heart; liver was perfused out in ice-cold saline solution
modified
2. "tissue was treated with liquid nitrogen and preserved for further enzymatic analysis" Does this sentence means tissue was freeze using liquid nitrogen?
modify sentence.
Sentence is modified for clarity
3. Provide animal ethical committee approval number.
Approval number is added
4. Stain of rats used in this study has not been mentioned.
Strain used is now mentioned in methodology
5. Cite appropriate reference for ccl4 treatment regime used in the present study.
added
6. Recently a study has reported hepatoprotective potential of Sida cordata leaf extract (http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/23608329) and hence, authors should incorporate details in their article regarding novelty of their study compared to previously published article. I would incorporate this reference and provide a comparative aspect in the discussion section.
Citation is made of the(http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/23608329 )paper. In previous version it was not cited because it was published after submission of manuscript.Cited reference deals with the leave extract of S.cordata while I am reporting whole plant extract.extraction methodology is also different.Accordingly changes and comparative analysiss is added in revised version.
7. Since, this was 4 weeks hepatotoxicity study, histology of liver becomes a pivotal parameter and i would suggest to add liver histology data.
Liver histology is added.
Reviewer 4
Minor Essential Revisions
Authors must correct statistics in table 2 (it must be p<0.05).
Corrected
For descriptive statistics, they must use label SD or STDV (not the two)
Followed
In Figure 2: authors must provide clear TLC or just describe TLC result as (data not shown).
TLC figure is deleted. Only results are described in the form of data not shown.
Figure 3 gives the same information as table3. If possible transfer one (Fig 3 for exemple) as supplementary data.
Figure 3 Shifte to supplememntary data.