Reviewer's report

Title: Pilot Randomized Trial on Mindfulness Training for Smokers in Young Adult Binge Drinkers

Version: 4 Date: 23 January 2013

Reviewer: Steven Ames

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions
(1) The second paragraph of the Background section contains text that is substantially similar to text found in the first paragraph of the Introduction of the following prior publication: Ames et al. (2010). Integrated smoking cessation and binge drinking intervention for young adults: A pilot investigation. Annals of Behavioral Medicine, 40, 343-349. I suggest modifying the text substantially to avoid concerns of plagiarism.

(2) Recruitment took place over a rather lengthy period of time (i.e., 9 months) and resulted in many calls (468 callers) in order to yield 55 smokers being randomized. Given the difficulty of recruiting and engaging young adults to participate in smoking cessation clinical trials, providing more detail about recruitment efforts would be of value to readers.

Minor Essential Revisions
(1) When referring to the age of participants please list units, that is years.

Discretionary Revisions
(1) The manuscript is quite lengthy, consider reducing its length.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.