Author's response to reviews

Title: Antileptospiral activity of xanthones from Garcinia magostana and synergy of gamma-mangostin with penicillin G

Authors:

Weeranuch Seesom (april_narak@hotmail.co.th)
Amornmart Jaratrungtawee (cin_thong@yahoo.com)
Sunit Suksumran (sunit@swu.ac.th)
Chantana Mekseepralard (chantana@swu.ac.th)
Piniti Ratananukul (piniti@mua.go.th)
Wasana Sukhumsirichart (wasanas@swu.ac.th)

Version: 4 Date: 8 March 2013

Author's response to reviews: see over
Response to reviewer’s comment

Reviewer: Satendra Singh

Major Compulsory Revisions
The article need to have major changes in the experimental and result section.
Response: The experimental and result section were edited.

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published
Response: The language correction had been done throughout the manuscript.

Abstract:
Line 31---Sentence can be---activity of purified xanthones and crude extracts from—
41-----Effect of most active crude extract should be included in the abstract.
42-----The sentence should be-----Crude extracts and purified xanthones from fruit pericarp of G. mangostana with significant antibacterial activity may be used to control leptospirosis
Response: We edited and added the sentence as suggestion in Abstract section.

Introduction
95—Objectives should contains both crude extract and purified xanthones
Response: We added the words “crude extract and purified xanthones” in the text as suggestion

Materials and Methods
Preparation of mangosteen extract
111----Protocol for crude extract preparation is completely confusing. Authors are using ethyl acetate for extraction at first level (SS-WS 01) followed by ethanol with very high polarity (SS-WS02) at second level. Every kind of polar compound will come in ethanol, then how they can have compounds from the same residue by using again ethanol and lower polarity solvent methanol.
Kindly explain. it is totally confusing
In my opinion extraction should be firstly in ethyl acetate then methanol and finally in ethanol.
121------Stock concentration 8 mg /ml
Double serial dilution using 100µl of stock will have a final concentration of drug (after addition of 100 µl of bacterial strain) 500 µg/ml or 500 mg/L.
According to the working solution (800 µg/ml) final concentration in the first well should be 50 µg/ml or 50 mg/L.
How authors can represent values in between 800-100 mg/L, when their maximum concentration is 50 mg/L.
Kindly recheck all values and give uniform units in entire manuscript.
Authors can have this reference for correct values and calculation

Head Should be -----Antibacterial Assay
Crude extract should be included with xanthones in each experiment.

127
130 Recheck the unit and concentration of extract and purified compounds
143----Recheck the concentration of penicillin

Response: We added the sentence, rewrite the confusing sentences, added reference [39] and recheck the unit and concentration and edited in the blue letter.

Results and Discussion
172-179-----Sentence should be…… Based on these results, it has been concluded that garcinone C and Y-mangostin belongs to 1,3,6,7-tetraoxygenetaed xanthones showed higher inhibitory activity. Similar findings were observed previously on 1,3,6,7-tetraoxygenetaed xanthones purified from G. mangostana [39].
Please rewrite the complete paragraph with suitable sentences.

Response: The sentence has been rewritten as suggestion.

Did authors observe any synergy effect with crude extract?

Response: We did not examine the synergistic effect using crude extract. So, there is data but it is interesting.

Use plant name uniformly either as G. mangostana or mangosteen

Response: The edited text used mangosteen.

Conclusion
Mention the activity of crude extract in conclusion.

Response: Crude extract has been added in conclusion.
Response to reviewer’s comment

Reviewer: Lahcen HASSANI

Reviewer's report:

   English is still unsatisfactory; it needs improvements before being published.

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Response  English has been edited.