Author's response to reviews

Title: In-vitro evaluation of selected Egyptian traditional herbal medicines for treatment of Alzheimer disease

Authors:

Shereen K. Ali (sheryali57@yahoo.com)
Ahmed R. Hamed (n1ragab2004@yahoo.com)
Maha M. Soltan (mahasoltan@netscape.com)
Usama M. Hegazy (usama.hegazy@gmail.com)
Esameldin E. Elgorashi (elgorashie@yahoo.com)
Ibrahim A. El-Garf (Ibrahim.elgarf@yahoo.com)
Ahmed A. Hussein (ahmohammed@uwc.ac.za)

Version: 2 Date: 23 February 2013

Author's response to reviews: see over
Title: In-vitro evaluation of selected Egyptian traditional herbal medicines for treatment of Alzheimer diseases

Editorial comments:
We recommend that you copyedit your abstract and manuscript to improve the quality of written English. We would suggest that you ask a native English speaking colleague to help you copyedit the paper. If this is not possible, you may need to use a professional language editing service.

We revised and improved the English as seen in the attached version.

Reviewer's report
Reviewer: Mahabir P Gupta

1. The language needs to be carefully corrected. Since the document was not in word I could not make the corrections.

- The language has been corrected; we thank Prof. Gupta very much for his patience during the correction of the article.

2. Voucher numbers of the plants should be provided.
Voucher numbers are existing in table 1.

3. In Table 3 if Galanthamine does not show any percent inhibition how can IC_{50} be calculated in the second column. This should be explained.

In Table 3, the sub-heading ACHE at the “% inhibition” column refers to the screening of the plant extracts to inhibit AChE and there is a footnote (a) below the Table to illustrate the screening concentration of the plant extracts against AChE (at 1000 µg/ml). This screening concentration was not applied to Galanthamine as it is a reference compound, this is why we put “n/a” (=not applicable) in front of Galanthamine in the ACHE subheading and only the IC_{50} of this reference compound was given (9.4 µg/ml) at the “ACHE sub-heading” of the “IC_{50} column” of Table 3.
Minor Essential Revisions

1- Title: the word herbal must deleted and Egyptian traditional medicine will be accurate description. The word herbal is restricted to the herbal parts only, however different parts of the selected plants were used. Similarly, the word herb must also deleted from keywords and the title of table 1&2.

We rather preferred to use the word herbal because the term “traditional medicine” is including many other disciplines which none of them covered in this article, also, is acceptable to include seed and roots under the term “herb”.

2- In Methods: Cyclooxygenase-1 assay, the author must give more details about the method used to determine the inhibition % obtained by the plant extract.

-Because the methodology is used without modification, we preferred to mention the reference rather than the experimental details to reduce the article volume.

3- In table 1, the 1st row, % Inhibition must divided to be % inhibition for AchE and COX-1 inhibitory activities, while % AA must added for DPPH activity column. Similarly, IC50 for the AchE and COX-1 inhibitory activities, while EC50 for the DPPH.

Table 1 is now modified according to the referee suggestions.

4- References: plant names in the references must be italic (reference number 34, 36,37, 38, 39, 40, 41, 42 and 43).

We re-checked the references and we italicized the plant names in 34, 36,37, 38, 39, 40, 41, 42 and 43.

Discretionary Revisions:

1- I recommend the first sentence written in the results replaced by: Of the tested plant extracts; Adhatoda vasica and Peganum harmala showed inhibitory effect on AChE. at IC50 294 #g/ml and 68 #g/ml respectively.

We changed the sentence according to the referee recommendation.

2- The discussion part is long and I recommend shortening the discussion part.

I agree with the referee and we thank her very much for valuable recommendation, but we preferred to give readers a complete survey on each plant mentioned in the article and their biological effects on AD to enrich their knowledge after reading the article.

3- In Methods, the multi-well plate AchE Inhibitory assay, I recommend that the equation numbered to be equation 1 while for the Antioxidant activity part, the equation will be equation 2.

We numbered the equations according to referee recommendation.
Reviewer’s report
Reviewer: Nahla NA Abdel-Azim

Reviewer’s report:

1. Minor Essential Revisions
   Please see the attached revise
   
   We thank the referee and we followed strictly the corrections in the corrected attached version.

2. Discretionary Revisions
   The authors should write full plant names if they are mentioned for the first time throughout this text. Please see the attached revised manuscript
   
   We rechecked the botanical names and we completed the missed names

I hope that with the corrections made, the paper will be accepted for publication.

Thank you and the referees for the careful revision of the manuscript and helpful suggestions.

Yours sincerely,
Ahmed A. Hussein