Author's response to reviews

Title: Evaluation of Pharmacological Activities and Assessment of Intraocular Penetration of an Ayurvedic Polyherbal Eye Drop (ItoneTM) in Experimental Models

Authors:

Thirumurthy Velpandian (tvelpandian@hotmail.com)
Pankaj Gupta (gupta.aiims@gmail.com)
Alok Kumar Ravi (ravialok@yahoo.com)
Hanuman Prasad Sharma (coolhanusharma@gmail.com)
Nihar Ranjan Biswas (nr_biswas@yahoo.com)

Version: 2 Date: 20 October 2012

Author's response to reviews: see over
To,

The Editor in Chief

BMC Complementary & Alternative Medicine

20th Oct 2012

Sub: Submission of revised manuscript of ID No. 1620577892776062

Dear Sir / Madam,

Hereby we are submitting the revised manuscript of ID No. 1620577892776062 entitled “Evaluation of Pharmacological Activities and Assessment of Intraocular Penetration of an Ayurvedic Polyherbal Eye Drop (ITONE™) in Experimental Models”. The queries raised by the reviewers as well as the editor have been duly answered.

We hope now you would find the manuscript suitable for publication in your esteemed journal.

Thanking you

Yours sincerely

Dr. T. Velpandian

Corresponding author
Reviewer-1

We thank Dr. Nakada for the valuable comments and suggestions. Indeed that they are of immense importance in improving the content of the manuscript in terms of its scientific value. Hereby, I am enclosing point -to- point reply for the comments and suggestions.

Major Compulsory Revisions

Q.1. To explain the effect of variation ………. natural extract is not constant.

Reply: We agree with the reviewers that in case of the extract if made for one time in lab scale, the chances of variation is unavoidable. However, after our detailed discussion with the manufacturer of this product we understood that the batch to batch variation of the contents has been continuously monitored by their in-house Quality Assurance team with the help of gas chromatography coupled mass spectrometry (GC-MS) to ensure the product uniformity. For our analysis we have obtained preservative free PHF formulation from Dey’s medical store. This information is mentioned in the manuscript on page 5 line 9.

Q.2. To evaluate the effect of vehicle of PHF in all pharmacological and toxicological assays.…

Reply: Thanks for this valid question. As far as the manufacturing process of Itone™ eye drops are concerned, the vehicle used for the formulation is water for injection. Unlike, other pharmaceutical products no other added additives were used in the formulations. It was confirmed from the manufacturer. Therefore, appropriate saline and water for injection were used as control in the study.

Minor Essential Revisions

Q.1. To explain Itone in more detail, for example, composition, lot number etc.

Reply: Thanks for the suggestion, required modification have been made in the manuscript and the information has been included on the page no 4 line no 12 and page no 5 line no 9.
Q.2. To explain the line color in Fig. 6….

Reply: The reviewer is correct as the line color difference depicts the difference in monitoring mass units of the ingredients of PHF detected in aqueous humor samples of rabbit eyes.

Q.3. To put amount of dosing/concentration of each drug in table. 2, 3…

Reply: As per your suggestion the concentrations of each drug have been incorporated in tables 2 and 3.

Q.4. Rechecking the sentence

Reply: As per the suggestions, suitable modifications have been done.

Reviewer-2

We thank Prof. Ellis Hon for his valuable comments and suggestions. We respect your comments.

Q.1. The research is interesting ........ to +10 in each group.

Reply: We feel that using animals for eye research is a sensitive matter for common public and as a result we often face problems in getting the approval for more number of animals (beyond n=5 for rodents). Therefore, as per the institutional ethical guidelines and lack of permission from institutional animal ethics committee we could not increase the numbers. However, we too agree with Prof. Ellis that it would have been more sound if the number of replicates are increased to 10+ in each group.

Editorial

The manufacturers did not play any role in the design and implementation, or in the interpretation of results of the study. However, we thank Dey’s Medical Store for providing us academic research grant for the documentation of the
scientific merits of Itone\textsuperscript{TM} PHF. This information is available on page no 17 line no 29.