Reviewer's report

Title: Inhibition of melanogenesis and antioxidant properties of Magnolia grandiflora L. flower extract

Version: 2 Date: 1 April 2012

Reviewer: Chi-Feng Hung

Reviewer's report:

Comments

1. Authors did not describe the origin of M. grandiflora L. That is important for quality of extract.
2. Fig. 1 showed that the extract had no cytotoxic effect on melanoma cell. However, this extract increases the cell viability of melanoma cell at 10 and 12.5%. This indicated that this extract could increase cell proliferation of melanoma cell. That is not safe. Authors should carry out the safety experiment of extract on normal cells. On the other hand, what is 120% of cell viability?
3. Fig. 2A showed that this extract inhibited the activity of tyrosinase. However, this effect is not concentration dependent.
4. Fig. 2C showed that this extract inhibited the activity of tyrosinase by 80%. Why only the extract inhibited the production of melanin by 40%?
5. Why were the inhibitory quantities of tyrosinase of extract different in Fig. 2C and Fig. 3?
6. Authors described that TRP-1 and TRP-2 participated in regulation of tyrosinase activity. Fig. 3 we can not find the inhibitory effects at 10% treatment of extract but increase the activity.
7. Fig. 3A is not clear and difficultly read.
8. Fig. 3B did not show the statistics.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.