Author's response to reviews

Title: Anthelmintic and relaxant activity of Verbascum thapsus Mullein.

Authors:

Niaz Ali Dr (niazpharmacist@yahoo.com)
Syed Wadood Ali Shah Mr (pharmacistsyed@gmail.com)
Ismail Shah Mr (ismailshah09@yahoo.com)
Ghayour Ahmed Mr (pahrmacist@gmail.com)
Mehreen Ghias Mrs (mehreenghias@yahoo.com)
Imran Khan Mr (imrankhan572@yahoo.com)

Version: 2 Date: 3 October 2011

Author's response to reviews: see over
Point wise cover letter

Title of manuscript: Anthelmintic and relaxant activity of Verbascum thapsus Mullein.

Reviewer 1: Mohammad Hossein Boskabady

Reviewer’s report/ Comment:
No further revision is suggested. Accepted for publication in his opinion.

Point wise cover letter

Title of manuscript: Anthelmintic and relaxant activity of Verbascum thapsus Mullein.

Reviewer 2: Richard Cimanga Kanyanga

Comments and details:

1. Term “Abstract” is added before background as suggested.
2. All typographic corrections are rectified as suggested and are colored / highlighted yellow. Key addition and corrections are as under:
3. Size of test worms are now mentioned in the text of manuscript.
4. Average weight is now mentioned in text of manuscript.
5. Physiological solutions are now mentioned along with their composition as asked.
6. The rabbits’ jejunum spontaneous rhythmic activities are very ideal for study of relaxant activity as it does not need the use of an agonist to stimulate. Relaxant activity of test samples were checked which is already mentioned in the manuscript.
7. The pharmacological procedures sentences are revised to correct the grammar and give a clear message for readers. Also few sentences are added as highlighted
yellow in the experimental of the relaxant and calcium channel blocking activities so that everyone shall understand and be able to reproduce the results.

8. P values are now mentioned in Results and discussion as suggested to mention the level of significance.

9. References are corrected as asked and are highlighted yellow.

Reviewer's report

Title: Anthelmintic and relaxant activity of Verbascum thapsus Mullein.

Version: 1 Date: 18 August 2011

Reviewer 3: Bishnupada Roy

Reviewer's report:

Major compulsion revision:

Referring to the stance that the studies deal with preliminary account of anthelmintic activity. Indeed we did this as per our objectives already set. One can go beyond the preliminary set. Some other body may work on the plant to isolate the phytochemicals and then go onto to explore its mechanism on molecular level. So far relaxant activity is concerned, we did that in detail. We explained its possible mechanism that is through voltage operated calcium channels which is evident from the design of the studies. Therefore, I would request to wave the further work as asked. Let, others shall work where they have facility for such sort of research. With regard to your concern that

“ The authors showed that the plant is affective against both nematode and cestode parasites. These two kinds of helminths belongs to different phyla and are structurally and physiologically different, therefore, drugs which work well against one are generally not useful against other, with a few exceptions”.

Sir, your above concern is a hypothesis, while our work is based on practical experimentations where it proved to be effective. If the extract is effective against both the classes, then it shall be given importance.

Moreover, if we go to the basic pharmacology book by Keatzung, which is referenced at reference no: 16 in the manuscript, that albendazole is a drug that is effective against cestodes and nematodes.
Therefore, it is requested that the observation may please be wavered as this point is not raised by other reviewers and is backed by an authentic text book of pharmacology.

Essential minor revision:

1. The abbreviation Vt.Cr is removed from background and expressed first in method.

2. “The dilute extract was concentrated (Yield = 9.9%) under ..... 
   a. The sentence is revised to remove ambiguity as asked. i.e. “The process was repeated thrice. The filtrates were combined and evaporated under reduced pressure using a rotary evaporator at 40 °C till a solvent free semisolid extract was obtained (yield= 9.9%”).

3. The phytochemical protocol is elaborated to mention the types of phytochemicals for which tests are conducted.

4. Anthelmintic activity

5. “Authors prepared the test sample in distilled water, instead of phosphate buffered saline (PBS). PBS is used in in vitro experiment to provide the parasite a medium near to its natural habitat”
   a. Yes, we used the normal saline and further a negative control was run to rule out any possible unwanted effect on the physiology of the test worms.

6. Statistical interpretation and reading of chart data
   Student “t” should be replaced by “student’s t-test”

   Action: Written now in manuscript as “student’s t-test”

7. Results:

   In the experimental the authors mentioned that the test materials were prepared in distilled water, however, in Table 1, it is indicated as saline. So it is not clear whether the test medium was distilled water or saline water.

   Answer / action: The medium was normal saline not distilled water. And negative control was run to rule out possible unwanted effect of medium and environment.

8. The manuscript (as a whole) need minor language correction.
9. Action: the manuscript is revised elsewhere. Large sentences have been simplified to avoid any ambiguity and grammatical errors.

Sir, the observations raised by you are highlighted green in the manuscript for your easy reference.

Regards!