Reviewer's report

Title: Solenostemon monostachyus, Ipomoea involucrata and Carica papaya seed oil versus Glutathione, or Vernonia amygdalina: Methanolic extracts of novel plants for the management of sickle cell anemia disease

Version: 2 Date: 24 September 2012

Reviewer: Adakole Abu

Reviewer's report:

Solenostemon monostachyus, Ipomoea involucrata and Carica papaya seed oil versus Glutathione, or Vernonia amygdalina: Methanolic extracts of novel plants for the management of sickle cell anemia disease

General comments: A good paper that contributes additional information on the potentials of medicinal plants in the management of sickle cell anemia.

Title: Were the extracts really effective in managing the symptoms of sickle cell disease or in ameliorating the sickle cell anemia? The title as it is seems not justifiable.

Abstract: Ok

However, the phrase “many populations” is too generalized as the Caucasians are not afflicted.

The conclusion should be phrased to only indicate the potentials of the extracts since the sickling effects were not completely reversed.

Background: OK, But there seems to be no distinction between sickle cell anemia and sickle cell disease.

Materials and methods: OK

Results: OK

Discussion: Information on antisickling property of Vernonia amygdalina is still experimental; is it right to use it as a standard?

References: ok

Check the spelling of Ipomoe? In Fig.2

Others: Title of Table 3 is not clear. Table 4 is not shown; why was there such a wide variation (204.70±35.09 123.81±37.97) in the Lactate dehydrogenase activity of the control and that of Carica papaya seed oil (152.70±45.77 vs 14.03±8.56)? Was this treatment related?

What could have been responsible for the variations in catalase activity of healthy blood donors (Control 46.40 ± 6.37 and 152.53 ± 46.10 for male and female respectively)?