Reviewer's report

Title: Modulation of apoptosis in human hepatocellular carcinoma (HepG2 cells) by a standardized herbal decoction of Nigella sativa seeds, Hemidesmus indicus roots and Smilax glabra rhizomes with anti-hepatocarcinogenic effects.

Version: 4 Date: 4 March 2012

Reviewer: Rajan Somasundaram

Reviewer's report:

Minor essential revision:
I am still somewhat concerned about differences of concentrations used in different experiments. ("Please discuss the differences in the concentrations of the decoction between earlier studies and the present study (0-50 mg/ml vs. 0-1200 µg/ml"). Thus, the answer seems a little sparsely to really explain the difference in the experiments ("In this experiment the standardized decoction was completely dissolved in 1 % DMSO in water while in previous studies it was dissolved only in water. When freeze dried decoction is dissolved in pure water it dose not dissolve completely; therefore dose range may be varied in the two experiments"). This difference should be mentioned and discussed briefly. Otherwise the manuscript now seems acceptable to me.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I have none of those points to declare!