Reviewer’s report

Title: Prakriti (Ayurvedic concept of constitution) and variations in platelet aggregation

Version: 1 Date: 20 August 2012

Reviewer: Alex Hankey

Reviewer’s report:

General
This paper reports an investigation of variation of platelet aggregation between individuals of different Prakritis. The results are as might be expected – that Kapha prakriti produces slowest reaction rates, though the Vata was not statistically significantly different from the Pitta prakriti result.

The experiment makes significant advances in our understanding of dosha prakriti dependence of an important parameter and should be published when the few weaknesses in the reporting and analysis have been remedied.

Major Compulsory Revisions
1. Stated Distribution of Prakritis: it is well known that there are mixtures of prakritis as well as extreme types. The analysis makes no mention of the mixed Prakritis that must have been present in the population sample analyzed. Assigning all subjects to extreme groups simply on the basis of maximum score, is not, in this reviewer’s opinion, either advisable or acceptable.

2. Reanalysis: The data needs to be carefully reanalyzed with this in mind; a certain measure of balanced mixtures of prakriti should be excluded from the analysis – say anything between 40/60 and 60/40 in the top two prakriti scores. I am of the opinion that greater distinction between each Prakriti type may be obtained if this subanalysis is carried out.

Minor Compulsory Revisions

Additional Reference(s), Patwardhan’s group has published an important paper on higher drug metabolizing capacity of Pitta types (E.G. eCAM 249528), which is similar to the higher platelet aggregation shown by the pitta group in this study. It should at least be referred to if not (briefly) discussed. Note also their review of the field doi: 10.4103/0975-9476.59824.

Discretionary Revision

Prakriti Determination: This is notoriously tricky. It is good that the questionnaire used is given in Table 1, however, the methods used by the Vaidyas should also be specified e.g. did they include pulse diagnosis, or only the various approaches specified in Charaka and other texts.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'