The purpose of this manuscript was to study the acute and repeated dose 28-day oral toxicity of a Siddha medicine “Nuna Kadugu” in rats. This study was designed according the following guidelines:


The materials and methods of this study contain several weaknesses and therefore this manuscript needs major revision before to be reconsidered for publication.

Comments:


2.4. Standardisation on Nuna

The study indicates that were analyzed the phenols, tannins and flavonoids compounds (this data are expressed in the data section) but it should be necessary to indicate the qualitative and quantitative composition.

2.5. Animals and husbandry

The study does not indicate the source of animals used.

This study is done by oral application of the compound. However, the authors did not indicate how was administrated the compound (i.e. by gastric tube or by intubation cannula). The vehicle used was carboxy methyl cellulose but in the manuscript is not justified their use as vehicle. The study indicates the dose volume of vehicle in control animals group but it was not indicated the volume dose in the treated animals group. On day 15, how the animals were sacrificed?
2.7. Repeated dose 28-day oral toxicity study

In this manuscript is described that it was used as vehicle 0.3% carboxy methyl cellulose in distilled water, whereas in the tables the authors indicated 0.5% carboxy methyl cellulose. That needs to be clarified.

The dose volume for each of the animals groups (control and treated) are not indicated.

The blood samples were withdrawn at the end of the treatment period. The animals were anesthetized. Between the haematological parameters there is reference to any blood coagulation parameter as indicated by European standards (e.g. measure of time or ability to clot blood).

2.8. Histopathology

No details on the sacrifice of animals are indicated.

The necropsy was performed in all animals. Why the authors have not taken the lung (right and left), prostate and epididymis (right and left), lymph nodes (preferably one lymph node covering the route of administration and another one distant from it, to account for systemic effects) and peripheral nerve (sciatic or tibial) as indicated in the European guidelines.

The following organs weights were not presented (i.e. epididymides (right and left), and thymus.

3. Results

It would be of interest to present the figures and table data by sex.

The weights of the following pair’s organs (kidneys, testis, and adrenal glands) should be presented separately. The rate body weight/organ must be also included.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.