Reviewer’s report

Title: Randomized Trial of a Mind and Body Technique for Weight Loss Maintenance

Version: 1 Date: 23 October 2011

Reviewer: Frank f Greenway

Reviewer’s report:

Minor essential Revisions:
1. This article has a negative result relative to its original hypothesis. The positive aspects of this study were found in exploratory secondary analyses confined to 20% of the original cohort (28 in the TAT group and 28 in the SS group). In view of this, I think it is important that the conclusions be stated in more tentative terms such as the secondary analysis suggests the need for further studies looking at those that lose above a certain percent of baseline body weight for confirmation that TAT maintains weight loss better than social support in that subgroup.
2. This reader questions the significance of a 1.25kg difference in weight maintenance over the course of a year. If this amount of weight difference has clinical relevance, it would be helpful for the authors to elaborate on that relevance.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I have consulted for companies making pharmaceuticals, dietary herbal supplements and medical foods, but none of these relationships represent a competing interest in reviewing this manuscript.