Reviewer's report

Title: Quality Assessment and Anti-obesity activity of Stellaria media (Linn.) Vill.

Version: 3 Date: 8 July 2012

Reviewer: WATCHO Pierre

Reviewer's report:

Major compulsory revisions

Authors were initially (see my two previous reports) asked to support with a reference their methodological approach relative to the induction of obesity with a high fat diet and to give more lights on the discrepancy observed between body weight, food intake and adipose tissue.

In their attempt of answering, authors provided the reference number [21] to support their methodology. Although this reference partially supports their protocol (2 weeks for obesity induction), some aspects of this work are still difficult to understand:

1- The difference between the diets used: [normal (433.2 Kcal/100g) and high fat (583 Kcal/100) diets]. Are the calculations well done? Using these diets (closed diets), one could wonder why the normal diet itself did not provoke obesity.

2- The authors found that after 2 weeks of HFD, there was an increase in body weight gain without any change in food intake in all experimental groups. This observation continues to make the work doubtful.

Discretionary revisions

- Considering that this present report is not different from the previous ones, it is once more difficult for me to give any consideration to this paper.

Best regards

Pierre WATCHO, PhD
Associate Professor

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests