Reviewer's report

Title: Anti-ageing potential of Vayasthapana Rasayana correlates with decreasing oxidative stress by free-radical quenching action

Version: 5 Date: 24 January 2011

Reviewer: Bruce Demple

Reviewer's report:

I would say that Prof. Goto's points were appropriate, and authors have made a small effort to respond to them. Certainly removing the claims about aging (as in the original title) was important. However, I suspect that it is impossible truly to standardize the extracts, not least because of inherent variability in using plant materials (fluctuations in their composition, variations in extraction of different components, etc.).

So the best one can hope for is the ability of others to follow it up, and they do seem to provide appropriate information for that. Clearly some mechanistic studies would eventually be in order, but it is hard to see how such work can be developed meaningfully without identifying the active components from the many that would be present in the extracts.

Although they corrected the manuscript appropriately for Prof. Goto's comments, I have to make one other point: the precision of the measurements is wildly over-reported. It is hardly possible that they could have measured the reducing ability of the extract as 1168.36 uM as claimed (p. 8, bottom). Pipeting errors alone will certainly have been at least a few percent, which would translate into something like 1170 +/- 20 uM at best, more likely something like 1170 +/- 100 uM.

All the extra digits are likely nothing more than a result of "calculator disease", e.g., dividing 1.0 by 3.0 and coming up with 0.33333333333, which is of course ridiculous. They need to modify the all reported precisions appropriately to reflect such limitations, which is a basic issue of significant figures. That is not hard to do if they understand this subject.