Reviewer’s report

Title: Inhibitory Activity of a Standardized Elderberry Liquid Extract Against Clinically-relevant Human Respiratory Bacterial Pathogens and Influenza A and B Viruses

Version: 1 Date: 8 November 2010

Reviewer: Ladislav Kokoska

Reviewer’s report:

The manuscript contains data on the antibacterial and antiviral effects of the extract from Sambucus nigra L. fruits. In my opinion, the effectiveness verification of commercially available standardized product against clinically relevant pathogens is the main practical benefit of the study. It could be acceptable after extensive rewriting of several parts and implementation of certain data on methodology.

Major Compulsory Revisions

1. More detailed specification of the extract tested (especially extraction procedure used) and method of its characterization (HPLC conditions) should be provided in the METHODS section.

2. Since clinical isolates of bacteria were used, it is important to provide data on their susceptibility to some reference antibiotic standard(s) [positive control(s)]. These data should be provided in Tables 1 and 3.

3. The data on statistics (number of replicates and experiments) should be clearly indicated for each assay.

4. The DISCUSSION needs extensive rewriting (style of the first part of the section reminds rather description of results than discussion). The results achieved in the study should be compared more in detail with data previously published on antimicrobial and antiviral activities of S. nigra fruit extracts or compounds (e.g. Hearst et al., 2010; Manganelli et al., 2005). The RESULTS and DISCUSSION could be combined into a single section.

Minor Essential Revisions

1. The data on geographical distribution, botany, and uses of S. nigra summarized in the first paragraph of BACKGROUND chapter should be supported by appropriate reference(s).

2. Since Table 2 repeats data showed in Figure 1, it can be excluded.

3. Unification of data presented in different parts of the manuscript is also necessarily. For example, both agar diffusion and broth dilution tests are described in the METHODS section of the manuscript; however, the abstract mentions broth dilution tests only.
References


Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests