Author's response to reviews

Title: Seasonal variation in the incidence of preeclampsia and eclampsia in tropical climatic conditions.

Authors:

Vidya Subramaniam (vidyasubramaniam@hotmail.com)

Version: 2 Date: 25 July 2007

Author's response to reviews: see over
Ref: MS:2096187711342468 - Seasonal variation in the incidence of preeclampsia and eclampsia in tropical climatic conditions.

Dear Editor,
BMC Women’s Health.

Many thanks for the peer review and comments on my manuscript. I have now revised the manuscript by responding to each comment raised by both the reviewers.

The point-by-point revisions to the individual reviewers’ comments are enclosed in the next pages.

Please accept the revised manuscript and consider it for publication.

Yours sincerely,

Vidya Subramaniam
Response to reviewer comments: (Per Magnus)

Major compulsory revision:

- Our data does not have selective selection bias due to referral pattern as we treat pre-registered local patients. **Revised added text: 3rd paragraph in ‘Discussion section’**.

Minor essential revision:

- There is no error in the calculation. The discrepancy in the numbers existed because the number of patients with eclampsia have been excluded the total of preeclampsia patients. This has been rectified and clarified in **revised text: 2nd sentence in ‘Results section’ and Table 1**.
Response to reviewer comments: (Ira Bernstein)

Major Compulsory Revisions:

1. Suggested paper has been discussed and cited. **Revised added text:** last 3 sentences of 1st paragraph in ‘Background section’ and new reference (13) in the ‘Reference section’.

2. We had already acknowledged that the lower temperature in monsoon season is related to increased risk of eclampsia (paragraph 4 in discussion). We now confirm the similarity of this finding to publications. **Revised added last sentence in paragraph 4 of ‘Discussion Section’**.

3. Dr. Bernstein has raised an interesting query regarding possible plasma volume explanation, which has been stated to occur in summer season (references 2-4 in Dr. Bernstein’s review). First of all the two references (Morimoto T et al and Shapiro Y et el) both relate to plasma volume changes which occur as a response to acute heat stress and are not relevant in present context. We agree with the publication by Kristal-Boneh E et al from Israel showing that plasma volume increases in summer. However, whether this phenomenon occurs in the monsoon region is not known and how it affects the serum osmolality is uncertain. We have explained this at length in our revision. **Revised added text:** paragraph 7 and 1st sentence of paragraph 8 in ‘Discussion section’ & new reference (20) in ‘Reference section’.

Minor Essential Revision:

- Typo error (4th line, Methods) has been corrected to March 1993
General Comments:

1. This is an observational study assessing the difference in the incidence of eclampsia / preeclampsia in different climatic conditions. Clinical data on individual patients is beyond the scope of this study. At our hospital we dealt with predominant local patient community, but again we don’t have information regarding if the eclamptic patients lived further away. **Revised paragraph 3 in ‘Discussion section’**.

2. Again, we dealt mainly with local population so transportation delay was not anticipated. **Revised paragraph 3 in ‘Discussion section’**.

3. About eclampsia occurring outside the hospital: We do not have data and is beyond the scope of this study.

4. Regarding treatment of preeclampsia: **Revised added text – last 2 sentences of paragraph 2 in ‘Discussion section’**.

Response to reviewer comments: (Ira Bernstein)