Reviewer's report

Title: Examination of EIF2B genes in a large panel of patients with premature ovarian failure

Version: 1 Date: 13 September 2004

Reviewer: antonino forabosco

Reviewer's report:

General
The authors have screened known EIF2B mutations, causing ovarioleukodystrophy, in a wide number of POF patients. The methods applied are appropriate for the limited goal of the project. In order to realize a more complete work, it would have been better using DHPLC technique, considering the big size of the genes.
The methodology used by the authors is sufficiently described, even if a more precise description (list of the primers used and conditions of PCR) would have been required.
The data are well controlled.
The manuscript adheres to the standards for reporting and data deposition.
The discussion and conclusions are adequately supported by the data provided by the work.
The title is not appropriate.
The abstract is well done.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

- The title does not reflect the content of the work; we suggest this one: "Screening for known mutations in EIF2B genes in a large panel of patients with premature ovarian failure".
- We prefer to define "pure" premature ovarian failure instead of "spontaneous".
- We suggest to add a table with the sequences of primers used and their PCR conditions.
- The use of the term "mutations" for genes and for proteins in the same speech generates confusion and mislead readers.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests: