Reviewer's report

Title: Behind the Silence of Harmony: Risk Factor Patterns for Physical and Sexual Violence among Women in Rural Indonesia

Version: 1 Date: 15 June 2011

Reviewer: Sukaina Alzyoud

Reviewer's report:

General Comments:
This study is very interesting given that there is a lack of published evidence with respect to gender-based violence in the developing countries. Additionally, the paper addresses an important public health issue in a developing country. However, text needs substantial revision throughout to improve the use of the English language. Moreover, and more importantly, the presented data should be accompanied by statistical analysis. At present, the conclusions of the study are not appropriately supported given that there were very little statistics performed and reported.

Specific Comments:
1. Major Compulsory Revisions:
   a. MATERIAL AND METHODS:
      i. Setting, Study Site, & Sample: “…Muslim population (88%)” what are the rest 12% represent?? & are the majority of Muslims are conservatives since there is a reference to that in the discussion!?
      ii. “…a national study performed by Rifka Annisa Women’s Crisis Center in Indonesia”, “…Purworejo district,…”, if the study is at the national level how come the Title state “Rural Indonesia”. Were the Urban and other settings excluded from this analysis?? Is Purworejo a center that hold the national data or JUST it is the site included in the study??? Are these women come from all segment of the Indonesian society??
      iii. “…Out of a total of 846 women, 765 consented…” how much these women represent of the Indonesian population?? Dose this number reflect a national sample?!?

   b. Results (Further Analysis needed): given the importance of the issue, there should be a detailed Description of the sample, which will give the reader a better understanding of the sample.
      i. “The only risk factor common for both types of violence was having an unfaithful husband.” Does this mean younger than the wife OR just having a young husband? OR married at a young age & how young. Table 1 only indicate [< 35 & > 35 years]
      ii. “less educated…” Can this be clarified more??? Table 1 only indicate 9 years
of education with no reference to any level of education???

iii. “….associated with individual male characteristics including applicable to a small group of men…” I’m not sure what does this means???

c. DISCUSSION: Over all the dissection section lacks to support the results and is not matching with study findings. More careful consideration, reorganization, and clarifications needed for the Discussion section as a whole.

i. First paragraph: “….particularly among women who live in poor areas….” There was NO indication or statistical analysis for such issue in the result section???
“…..husbands with low educational attainment…” Table 1 indicate only number of education years [< 9 & > 9] with no details that gives the reader a more clear picture in that regard.

ii. Second paragraph: “Given the significant associations between alcohol use and physical violence, the relatively lower prevalence of physical violence might be attributed to low rates of alcohol use reported in this area due to strictly enforced religious bans on alcohol use.” Does this mean that this area is inhabited by Muslims? Can this be added to the Description of the Sample?!?!?
“….. On the other hand, cultural and religious norms…..” There are no enough statistical analysis & results for this conclusion???
“……Religious-based schools (madrasah)—…” I did not see any results regarding this factor. Moreover, can the Authors give more details about the religious structure of the area and the country in general?!!? “…..particularly in the highland areas.” Is Purworejo a highland area & at the same time a rural area?!?!?

iii. Conclusion: “…. this study suggests that Javanese women…” Is Purworejo site part of this area??

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

'I declare that I have no competing interests'