**Reviewer's report**

**Title:** Factors affecting knowledge and perception of women about smoking: a cross sectional study from a developing country

**Version:** 3  **Date:** 8 February 2011

**Reviewer:** Joan M Brewster

**Reviewer's report:**

**Major compulsory revisions:**
1. I previously suggested that the authors recommend general education for women in Pakistan, and the authors claim to have made this addition, but I do not see it in the conclusion section. Instead, they discuss specific measures such as package warnings. While these may be important, the study findings suggest that general education is an important intervention. Education is the only factor consistently related to tobacco knowledge in the results.

2. In discussing the effect of smoking on the fetus in the results section, the authors state the “While 18% was not aware of any effect and 5% reported that it does not affect the fetus at all.” The difference between these two answers should be clarified.

3. There are fairly consistent significant relationships of education to knowledge. But the relationship with a smoker in the house is only for one question, and there is only one significant relationship with perceptions. The authors do not mention correcting for multiple comparisons, and the fact that so many relationships were tested should be mentioned as a limitation of the study.

**Minor essential revisions:**
4. The manuscript should be read for minor grammatical corrections by a native English speaker.

5. The authors mention the ITC result relating tobacco knowledge to education. It should be mentioned that these are all high income countries.

6. At the end of the introduction, the sentence should be “We investigated the knowledge … in three urban slum settlements in Karachi, Pakistan.”

7. In tables 2 and 3, there should be clarification of what the numbers and percentages are. Are these the numbers who knew about the effect, or believed the perception. And are the percentages of the total number of women in the factor category?

8. At the bottom of tables 2 and 3, separate the questions so that each is on a separate line.

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests
**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.