**Reviewer's report**

**Title:** Risk-reducing strategies for women carrying BRCA1/2 mutations with a focus on prophylactic surgery

**Version:** 3  **Date:** 21 May 2010

**Reviewer:** victor grann

**Reviewer's report:**

The article entitled Risk-reducing strategies for women carrying BRCA1/2 mutations with a focus on prophylactic surgery is an up-to-date analysis and summary of recent advances in the field of decision making for women who have tested positive for these mutations. It is well written for the most part and provides the latest information for women who test positive for BRCA1/2 along with their physicians.

The paper is essentially a review article that is for the most part well written and presents the latest information as a guide to guide to genetic counselors and physicians who care for high-risk women.

The methods of research are presented in a careful review of recent publications.

The discussion and conclusions are well balanced and the different interventions and strategies are presented.

**Concerns 1**

Limitations while briefly mentioned are not explored in detail. The paper is essentially a review article based on observational studies. It is imperative to add a strong limitation section. An example of this is the 1st paragraph on page 4 (Reference 23) discussing the metaanalysis by Lee et al., on survival among BRCA1/2 mutation carriers published in 2010 online. The entire paragraph which is located on page 4 about survival of BRCA1 breast cancer patients at the very beginning of the paper is misleading (Ref 21-23) without adding a detailed review of Lee's paper (ref 23).

2. This raises concerns about other statements unless the authors are confident that no other limitations exist.

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests'.