Reviewer's report

Title: End-of-life care in a COPD patient awaiting lung transplantation: a case report

Version: 1 Date: 13 January 2010

Reviewer: Donna Goodridge

Reviewer's report:

This is an important topic of significance to clinicians caring for people with advanced COPD and an interesting case.

It would be helpful to specifically describe competing/conflicting goals of care in the background section and the confusion that can be engendered for patients, families and clinicians. I think a short discussion of supportive care and how it is similar/different from conventional palliative care would also be useful.

p. 7 A more complete discussion of whether this patient met all of the transplant criteria as she became more ill would be helpful. Were these criteria re-visited? What are the implications to the patient and family of taking them off of the list? Incorporating a discussion of ethical principles and values would strengthen the discussion.

There is a significant body of literature related to treatment decision making that should be incorporated into the discussion.

The clarity of the manuscript will be greatly improved if the following editorial comments relating to grammar are incorporated:

a) Abstract: To prevent that eol care needs of COPD patients dying ...are not optimally addressed.

b) Abstract: The patient's eol care preferences may ask for a clear distinction....

c) The background is one long paragraph and will read much better if it is made into several paragraphs. The writing here is quite choppy.

d) p. 3 survival benefit of lung transplantation remains debated (debatable?)

e) Case Report: This section would benefit from general editing to improve flow and again the use of more paragraphs to mark changes in topic.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.