Reviewer's report

Title: Using respiratory rate and thoracic movement to assess respiratory insufficiency in amyotrophic lateral sclerosis: a preliminary study

Version: 2 Date: 17 November 2012

Reviewer: Mamede de Carvalho

Reviewer's report:

This version is much improved. The authors stressed the preliminary value of their results from this exploratory study.

Overall, I am pleased with this version.

Three point should be considered.

The authors remain not mentioning exclusion and inclusion criteria for study entry. In particular, it is relevant to know if patients with other medical conditions, in particular lung disorders, were accepted or excluded from this retrospective analysis.

The value of thoracic expansion was toned down by the authors, it is not mentioned in Conclusions, I do not understand the reason for it.

On page 11, the median time from the first symptoms to diagnosis is not so relevant as the range, which covers the large period from 1 to 60 months. It is difficult to accept 5 years time from disease onset to diagnosis in ALS.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I have no conflict, whatsoever