Reviewer’s report

Title: In vitro teeth whitening effect of two nicotine medicated chewing gums compared to a whitening gum and saliva

Version: 3 Date: 28 April 2008

Reviewer: Pier Francesco F Porciani

Reviewer’s report:

Major Compulsory Revisions
Authors must specify major components of tested chewing gums and which are whitening agents added to the gum used as positive control (i.e. xylitol and carbamide) because different types of whitening chewing gums are on the market (i.e. added with baking soda, polyphosphates, etc.) and to refer their consideration to those ingredients and not generally to all whitening chewing gums on the market.

Minor Essential Revisions
1. Authors have to inform that whitening appearance is more influenced by L than a and b therefore delta E is the difference in color but it may not show directly a whitening process which is more linked to factor L than to E.
2. Please avoid the use of word “benchmark” referred to that whitening chewing gum in Discussion section or support it with references.

Discretionary Revisions
I suggest to remove ref. [5] in M&M section Teeth Staining Broth preparation because I think it not linked to the sentence.
I suggest to move ref. [7] from Result (where it used to avoid reference) into M&M section when it is described the use of bovine teeth.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests