Reviewer's report

Title: Palatal mucosa derived fibroblasts present an adaptative behavior regarding cytokine secretion when grafted on the gingival margin

Version: 1
Date: 19 January 2014
Reviewer: LJ Jin

Reviewer’s report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

This paper presents the data on fibroblasts' innate response to LPS at different oral niches after grafting. The following critical points are made for authors’ consideration:

Abstract:

- The brief background of the study could be revised, as such readers can understand the aim of study without difficulty. Similarly, the Methods and Results could have been presented more clearly. The control group should be indicated.

Introduction:

The background and hypothesis of the study as well as the relevant question posed should be better defined and presented.

Materials and Methods:

- … ‘three healthy individuals’… It means systemically and periodontally healthy? In this case, a brief presentation of these subjects may be required.
- The overall study design could have been presented briefly.
- Some details of Pg LPS and E coli LPS should be given.
- Dose-dependent and time dependent assays could have been undertaken. In addition, the mRNAs of the cytokines investigated should have been measured as well.

Results:

- GMF control shows a higher basal expression of IL-6, IL-8 and TGF-beta than PMF is well noted. While it is difficult to appreciate that E coli LPS could not upregulate their expression (Figs. 3, 4 and 6). It seems that PMFs are unable to react to the Pg and E coli LPS stimulation. It should be interrupted with caution.

Discussion:

The major limitations of the study could be elaborated. The conclusion could be questioned due to the controversial data presented.
Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests: No.