Reviewer's report

Title: Is Human immunodeficiency virus (HIV) stage an independent risk factor for altering the periodontal status of HIV-positive patients? A South African Study.

Version: 2 Date: 23 September 2013

Reviewer: Sharon Liberali

Reviewer's report:

Dear authors

I was very pleased to see that you incorporated the changes recommended, in particular the assessment of ART and smoking on oral health. I feel that the research and article is far more robust as a result of this.

I would recommend that you review the formatting - there are some issues with spacing etc.

I would like to add the following corrections

1) as identified previously there is a description of groups A, B and C in the material and methods of the Abstract but it is still incorrectly placed in the Results section in the body of the paper

2) on page 12, the sentence "These findings are similar to those of Vastadis et al [26] and others [33,36] who found periodontal disease to be less prevalent in subjects with CD4+ counts <200 cells/mm3 than in those with CD4+ counts>500 cells/mm3[35]." is clumsy. I would suggest that you use the sentence from the first draft

3) on page 12, the age range of the study population is incorrectly identified as (17-55 years) but your data in Table 2 shows 20-55 years

4) in the conclusion you should acknowledge the impact of ART on the susceptibility of periodontal disease.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.