Reviewer’s report

Title: A multinodular goiter as the initial presentation of a renal cell carcinoma harbouring a novel VHL mutation.

Version: 1 Date: 5 September 2006

Reviewer: David N Poller

Reviewer’s report:

General

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

This is a single case report describing metastasis of a classical RCC to the thyroid. Although it is only a case report the findings and the methodology employed are interesting to pathologists concerned with the differential diagnosis of clear cell tumours of the thyroid.

There are a few minor typographical errors; page 8 line 8 should read 'thyroglobulin' and line 9 'metastasis'

It might also be worth commenting that somatic VHL mutations have not been identified in the thyroid except in MEN2 associated medullary carcinoma (see Koch CA et al BMC Cancer 2006;6:131) although LOH in the VHL gene has been identified in follicular carcinomas of the thyroid (clear cell thyroid carcinoma is currently regarded as a variant of follicular thyroid cancer) (see Hunt JL et Surgery 2003;134:1043-8).

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests