Reviewer's report

Title: Insulin Versus Oral Agents in the Management of Cystic Fibrosis Related Diabetes: A Case Based Study

Version: 1 Date: 26 January 2006

Reviewer: D S Bell

Reviewer's report:

General
The problem with this study is that it is too small, has no control group, is non-randomized and non-blinded and does not use an intention to treat analysis (the patients transferring to metformin and TZD should have remained in the insulin group.

However, the unique finding in this study which is unlikely to be due to chance is the improved FEV1 with TZDs. TZDs are anti-inflammatory and anti-proliferative both of which should be helpful in CF. Diseases such as psoriasis have been reported to improve sometimes dramatically with TZDs. Similarly inflammatory bowel disease symptoms improve with TZDs and studies of TZDs effects in rheumatoid arthritis and multiple sclerosis are underway.

I would recommend that the authors rewrite and re-title the article as the effect of TZDs on respiratory function in CF patients. The insulin, metformin and sulfonylurea groups would together act as the control group. Such an article would be of great interest to the diabetes and respiratory communities and would be easily accepted by medical journals.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------
Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------
Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------
Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)