Reviewer's report

Title: Reversible hypothyroidism and Whipple disease

Version: 1 Date: 2 November 2005

Reviewer: Didier Raoult

Reviewer's report:

General

Comments for authors :

This case report tentatively matches hypothyroidism and Whipple's disease.

- Hypothyroidism appears established
- Whipple's disease diagnostic is not documented using modern tools.

The authors report the use of PCR but the negative controls are not mentioned. The identification of the amplicon is not provided (sequence ? hybridization ? size on the gel). If such identification by sequence has not been performed the value of PCR is very low.

In a case without clear symptoms of Whipple's disease, all the diagnosis is based on histology which is unspecific. The case must be confirmed either by immunohistochemistry or by a convincing PCR. Many other organism (including mycobacteria) can be PAS positive.

Findly, the link between the putative Whipple's disease and hypothyroidism is not discussed.

T. whiplei have no majuscule in wipplei.

If the diagnosis of WD is confirmed by convincing PCR and for immunohistochemistry and the discussion structured to discuss the link between WD and hypothyroidism it could be published.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No