Reviewer's report

Title: Depression, Smoking, Physical Inactivity and Season independently associated with Midnight Salivary Cortisol in Type 1 Diabetes

Version: 2 Date: 15 June 2014

Reviewer: Margaret Grey

Reviewer's report:

Major compulsory revisions
The major problem with this manuscript is that while the analyses were cross-sectional, causation is implied throughout the discussion. Given that the hypotheses were not supported, implying that cortisol causes depression is quite problematic and goes far beyond the data reported. Further the statement, that ‘treatment for depression would lead to decreased complications’ is not supported at all by these data. That may be an hypothesis to examine in an RCT, but it was not tested in this paper.

Discretionary Revisions
More minor concerns include the need to add a brief explanation about how complications were defined. It is not sufficient to say that these were explained elsewhere.

While the background section identifies the variables to be studied, there is no coherent model to explain the hypothesized interactions.

Seasonality was found, but winter was not included in the data collected. This omission loses the potential to see SAD. The discussion about this aspect of the study also suggests the MSC causes suicidal ideation, which again, was not possible to determine in this correlational study.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.