Reviewer's report

Title: A diagnostic approach for defining Idiopathic Remitting Diabetes: a retrospective cohort study

Version: 3 Date: 4 March 2014

Reviewer: Charles Fox

Reviewer's report:

A diagnostic approach for defining Idiopathic Remitting Diabetes: a retrospective cohort study

Babiker et al. Exeter.

Andrew Hattersley and his colleagues in Exeter have built on their pioneering work in MODY to become world leaders in the niche specialty of unusual forms of diabetes. When Christine Burren, a paediatrician in Surrey, found two brothers who apparently made a full recovery from Type 1 diabetes, she turned to Andrew to co-author the first report of Idiopathic Remitting Diabetes. This appeared in Diabetes Care in 2004 (ref 6).

Eleven suspected cases of this condition have since been referred to the Exeter team and they have now sifted carefully through this cohort and weeded out 10 cases leaving only one patient who fulfils their extremely rigorous criteria. One possible patient has been excluded as the BMI is >30 and 4 patients have not yet remained off insulin for > 4 years. So as time goes by, the pick up rate from this cohort may increase but the authors are right to stick rigidly to their definition. This is therefore a textbook example of how to define a new, albeit very rare, condition.

Ref 19. It is customary to quote the date the website was accessed.

I would answer all your specific 9 questions in the positive.

Level of interest: An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests