Reviewer's report

**Title:** Screening South Asians for type 2 diabetes and prediabetes: a comparison of oral glucose tolerance test and haemoglobin A1c and characterization of individuals diagnosed

**Version:** 1  **Date:** 5 November 2012

**Reviewer:** Tomoko Nakagami

**Reviewer's report:**

This study has evaluated the efficacy of the use of HbA1c as a screening test for diabetes or pre-diabetes on a 75gram oral glucose tolerance test (OGTT) in 944 South Asians living in the Haugue of the Netherland. The study showed that HbA1c showed high predictabilities for diabetes and pre-diabetes on an OGTT. However, the overlap between HbA1c and OGTT classification was partial both for diabetes and pre-diabetes, respectively. People with diabetes identified by HbA1c had similar (no statistically different) means for CVD risks to those identified by sole OGTT. The same trend was found for people with pre-diabetes. Thus the study has concluded that a combined rather than a single test strategy should be considered in the screening for diabetes or pre-diabetes among South Asian populations.

**Major comments**

1. The study was nicely planned and performed, although the participation rate was low. Since data analyzed Asian Indians including immigrants are still scanty, the overall flow of the main text sounds common HbA1c screening story. The overall discussion should be expanded based on data from Indian ethic group to specialize this paper, as majority of cited references were data from Caucasoid populations.

2. The author has stated that a combined rather than single test strategy should be considered. etc.. This statement is not clear. Please clarify what is a combined strategy? Does it mean the combination use of HbA1c and OGTT? If yes, this combination is too costly and not realistic (not only for Indians but also other ethnic groups). If no, please explain.

**Level of interest:** An article of limited interest

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.