Reviewer's report

Title: NPC1 in Human White Adipose Tissue and Obesity

Version: 1 Date: 17 December 2012

Reviewer: William S Garver

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions:
None

Minor Essential Revisions:

The values in Table 1 are represented as mean ± SD. Although I suspect values in Figures 1 and 2 are also represented as mean ± SD, this should be included into the two figure legends.

Discretionary Revisions:

In the second paragraph of the discussion, it is written there is a discrepancy between decreased NPC1 gene dosage in mice which predisposes to weight gain and increased NPC1 gene expression in adipose of obese humans.

I would like the authors to reconsider this point of view in light of our findings presented at the annual obesity meeting (Obesity 18:S54, 2010).

In brief, we reported increased NPC1 gene expression (measured by increased amounts of NPC1 protein) in livers of obese wild-type mice fed a high-fat diet (I can send the results if authors are interested). These results are similar to the authors.

Therefore, as proposed by the authors, the increased NPC1 gene expression in white adipose tissue of obese humans may be compensatory. The reference to expression of leptin served as a good example.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests