Reviewer’s report

Title: Low serum creatinine is associated with type 2 diabetes in morbidly obese women and men: a cross-sectional study

Version: 4 Date: 3 February 2010

Reviewer: Giorgio Bedogni

Reviewer’s report:

Major Compulsory Revisions
None

Minor Essential Revisions
1. Prevalence: I apologize for having been too synthetic in my comment. This is the – hopefully understandable this time – reasoning: if “prevalent T2DM” is the outcome, it follows that one wants to model the “prevalence” or “prevalence rate” of TD2M (0 = no; 1 = yes) – these terms are equivalent. The odds ratio is however not a prevalence ratio when the prevalence of the outcome of interest is > 0.10. The solution is very simple: one has just to write the “odds of T2DM” instead of “prevalent T2DM”. This is a semantic problem, yes, but with far-reaching methodological implications.

2. Calculating the 95%CI of Spearman’s correlation coefficient can be done using bootstrap. This is very easy to do in R and Stata but can also be done with few effort in SPSS. I am not using SPSS from many years but I have looked at the manuals and it seems quite easy to do the calculation. These references may help (checked on 03-February-2010):

http://docs.google.com/viewer?a=v&q=cache:gHLtLJY4juUJ:support.spss.com/ProductsExt/Statistics/Documentation/18/client/Use...D_dcyYQWqFOr2KEaAqPSpLvlXRNMAMBQQgRlc6gVnT2u6Qz2fsjysysHrnRbpvAo_Q7dLOmMFuoFng3BTvC&sig=AHIEtbRPYaEcBl0K_Hg_uBjKWUzx7goVDg

Please, note that I am insisting on this point just for the reason that a measure of effect without 95%CI is of doubtful clinical relevance even if admittedly this is not a major point of your paper.

Discretionary Revisions

I am sorry to say that I am not still able to see the references in my PDF. This may be a problem with the web processing of the MS.

Can you specify the software you used to program GAM? I supposed it was R but I may be wrong owing to the above considerations. Please, note that I cannot read references and do not know what ref 24 is.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests