Reviewer's report

Title: The weight lowering effect of sibutramine and its impact on serum lipids in cardiovascular high risk patients with and without type 2 diabetes mellitus - an analysis from the SCOUT lead-in period

Version: 3 Date: 29 October 2009

Reviewer: Kenneth Fujioka

Reviewer's report:

the information is not new or novel and is basically a observational study of lipid changes in a 6 week lead in period. It does not apprear that the study was designed to look at lipid changes between diabetics and non-diabetics. What makes the data weak is the change in criteria(during the study) for enrollement to pts with both T2D and CVD (this will effect the lipids in the diabetic group)

the results of LDL and TGs decreasing with wt loss is well known as well as HDL going down with acute weight loss.

With that said this is a very important study and the findings will be of interest to some individuals. I would recommend a much shorter paper and try not to over reach the findings as again this study was designed to look at different end points, particularly trying to compare DM pts to non DM pts

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests