Reviewer's report

Title: The weight lowering effect of sibutramine and its impact on serum lipids in cardiovascular high risk patients with and without type 2 diabetes mellitus - an analysis from the SCOUT lead-in period

Version: 3 Date: 20 October 2009

Reviewer: Carlo Maria Rotella

Reviewer's report:

Dear BMC editor,

Dear authors,

this paper written by Weeke P et al analyzed the impact on weight loss and lipid profile of a 4 week treatment with sibutramine. 10,742 overweight and obese patients were enrolled and 8981 were type 2 diabetic subjects. The results showed a greater weight loss and improvement on lipid profile in non diabetic patients.

Major compulsory revisions: 1. The non diabetic subgroup revealed a baseline positive history of coronary heart disease (91.5%) and a significant higher prevalence of acute myocardial infarction (58.8% vs 37.1). The percentage of patients treated with statins is significantly higher in non diabetic subgroup. These data seem to justify a high cardiovascular risk profile of the analyzed population and furthermore the non diabetic LDL higher levels at baseline. For these reasons baseline characteristics need to be improved by analyzing the diagnosis of Metabolic Syndrome according to ATP-III (including fasting glycemia). 2. The antidiabetic oral therapy needs to be elucidated in relation to improvement on insulin resistance status and so in basal lipid profile. 3. These data are of interest but limited by the potential influence on lipid profile exerted by performing venous sampling during the day.

Minor essential revisions: 1. viz line 13 page 10 please specify HDL-C dip line 2 page 11 please specify

Best regards
Professor Carlo Maria Rotella

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests