Reviewer's report

Title: Histopathological and ultrastructural analysis of vestibular endorgans obtained from patients with Meniere’s disease

Version: 1 Date: 14 February 2009

Reviewer: Toshihisa Murofushi

Reviewer's report:

This is a morphological study of vestibular endorgans harvested from patients with Meniere’s disease at the time of labyrinthectomy. The authors described light-microscopic and electron microscopic findings in these patients. They found greater changes in the semicircular canals than the utricle. While it is a weak point that there is no control material, this study may be of value.

Major copulsory revisions

1. Although the authors described that significantly greater and more significantly more frequent degeneration in the horizontal and superior canals and the saccule than the utricle, the number of materials from the saccule is much limited. Therefore, the authors should only compare between the utricle and the canals.

Minor essential revisions

2. In the abstract, the authors described that “Other degenerative changes were noted among the five vestibular endorgans”, they did not present any data concerning the posterior canal crista.

3. P.8 L.5. Prior to the first use of “BM”, the authors should explain what BM is.


5. Fig.1
   Although the authors described on Fig.1-c in figure legends, there is no photo 1-(c).

6. Fig.5
   (b) “Meniere’s utricular macula” is not appropriate expression. Please revise it.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a
statistician.