Author's response to reviews

Title: Primary Nasopharyngeal non-Hodgkin lymphomas: a retrospective review of 26 morrocan patients.

Authors:

Wafa Allam (wafallam@yahoo.fr)
Nabil Ismaili (ismailinabil@yahoo.fr)
Sanaa Elmajjaoui (dr_majjaoui@yahoo.fr)
Brahim K Elgueddari (b.elgueddari@medramo.ac.ma)
Mohamed Ismaili (ismaillih2000@yahoo.fr)
Hassan Errihani (h_errihani@yahoo.fr)

Version: 4 Date: 19 October 2009

Author's response to reviews: see over
Author’s response to reviews:

MS: 6254460652968404
Primary Nasopharyngeal non-Hodgkin lymphomas: a retrospective review of 26 morrocan patients.

Author:

Allam wafa: wafallam@yahoo.fr

Version 2: 10 october, 2009

Author’s response to reviews: see over
Reviewer's report
Title: Primary Nasopharyngeal non-Hodgkin lymphomas: a retrospective review of 26 morrocan patients.
Version: 2 Date: 13 September 2009
Reviewer: M. Tezer Kutluk

Reviewer's report:
Thank you very much for giving me an oppurtunity to review the manuscript entitled “Primary nasopharyngeal non-Hodgkin lymphomas: a retrospective review of 26 morrocan patients”. Although retrospective the data presented in this article might be relevant because this is an interesting study of a special subgroup of patients with nasopharyngeal non-Hodgkin lymphomas. However with this form the article can be published only after the following revisions:

1. The article needs extensive linguistic correction before publication.
   I made some sentence’s change to improve linguistic in this paper as asked by the reviewer.

2. The histopathological data should be given according to WHO classification
   Histopathological data has been changed and replaced by the WHO classification as indicated by the reviewer.

3. The data of patients with diffuse large B cell lymphoma should be separately presented
   Another chapter has been added in results detailing all large B cell lymphoma and their survival as indicated by the reviewer.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field
Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published
Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.
Reviewer's report
Title: Primary Nasopharyngeal non-Hodgkin lymphomas: a retrospective review of 26 morrocan patients.
Version: 2 Date: 22 September 2009
Reviewer: Yok Lam Kwong

Reviewer's report:
Allam et al described a series of 26 patients from Morocco with nasopharyngeal lymphomas. The lymphomas were heterogeneous, and treatment results were presented. This is a very small series. In addition to documenting the types of lymphoma that might occur in the nasopharyngx of patients in Morocco, the article contains no novel information.

Specific comments
1. The article is overly lengthy for the information presented. It should be shortened to a letter to the editor.
This article has not been shortened to a letter of the editor, because I believe it's the first Mediterranean study nasopharyngeal lymphoma, which includes all the epidemiological characteristics and therapeutic.

2. It is necessary to use the WHO classification for lymphomas, instead of the Working Formulation.
Histopathological data has been changed and replaced by the WHO classification as indicated by the reviewer.

3. The figures are redundant and should be deleted.
I've left figures because i think they show the statistical difference in survival (overall survival and disease free survival) between all groups by stage.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest
Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published
Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.