Reviewer's report

Title: Hamartomas, teratomas and teratocarcinosarcomas of the head and neck: Report of 3 new cases with clinico-pathologic correlation, cytogenetic analysis, and review of the literature

Version: 2 Date: 17 September 2008

Reviewer: Thomas Jacques

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

The revised manuscript is much more tightly written. However, I am still worried that too much emphasis is being placed on the interpretation of the cytogenetics in terms of lineage. The statement in the abstract is too strong. In the best case, cytogenetic changes are more likely to indicate oncogenic mechanism than lineage. As the authors point our trisomy 12 has been described in a range of tumours. Furthermore, the statement that 'majority of malignant germ cell tumours' have trisomy 12 needs some qualification as I believe that this is often the case in older individuals with testicular tumours but is less true for extratesticular tumours in younger children.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests: I declare that I have no competing interests