Reviewer's report

Title: Hamartomas, teratomas and teratocarcinosarcomas of the head and neck: Report of 3 new cases with clinico-pathologic correlation, cytogenetic analysis, and review of the literature

Version: 1 Date: 10 September 2008

Reviewer: Thomas Jacques

Reviewer's report:

- Discretionary Revisions (which are recommendations for improvement but which the author can choose to ignore)
  None

- Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

  The manuscript (particularly the discussion) is rather long for what is predominantly case report(s) and would benefit from some focussing.

  The manuscript is generally very well written but there are a few scattered typos that need correction.

- Major Compulsory Revisions (which the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

  This is well-written and interesting report of three diverse tumours. Its value is mostly as educational case report(s) and partly as it increases the cytogenetic literature on three rare tumours. Its weakness that there is only one case of each tumour type and great emphasis has been placed on the cytogenetics as indicating the origin of the tumours. While the authors have acknowledged the lack of specificity of trisomy 12, I think that too much emphasis has been placed on the cytogenetics in the interpretation of the lineage of the tumours.

  Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

  Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

  Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

  Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.