Reviewer's report

Title: The Posterior Communicating Arteries in the Patients with Sudden Deafness: Evaluation with Magnetic Resonance Imaging (MRA)

Version: 1 Date: 4 October 2005

Reviewer: Desiderio Passali

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

A number of limitations to the study dampen the enthusiasm for publication:
- Statistical methods are improperly applied. Infact the Authors applied the Kruskal-Wallis analysis of variance to a 2x2 contingency table, whereas a Chi square or Fisher exact test would be appropriate. I consider this a major fault in basic statistical methodology and I would suggest the revision by a statistical reviewer.
- The MRI results by the authors are in conflict with the previously reported association between non functioning PCOAs and SD. Infact the MRI methodology adopted by the authors do not include a functional test such as ipsilateral CCA compression. It is well known that the anatomical absence of PCOA is a very rare event <1% (Kapoor et al. Morphology and comparative anatomy of circulus arteriosus cerebri in mammals. Anat Histol Embryol. 2003 Dec;32(6):347-55.).
- The author should emphasize this point and comment
- The examined population is Japanes vs. the Caucasian population examined by De Felice et al. This point should be briefly commented.

Minor Essential Revisions
- A thorough language revision by a native English speaker is suggested.

What next?: Reject because scientifically unsound

Level of interest: An article of insufficient interest to warrant publication in a scientific/medical journal

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No