Reviewer's report

Title: The Posterior Communicating Arteries in the Patients with Sudden Deafness: Evaluation with Magnetic Resonance Imaging (MRA)

Version: 1 Date: 22 August 2005

Reviewer: Yi-Ho H Young

Reviewer's report:

General

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

BMC #5431102207622999

Tsushima & Endo: The posterior communication arteries in the patients with sudden deafness

This paper is a negative study, concerning about the relationship between Pcom and sudden deafness. The rationale for this paper is based on a recent report from the Lancet 2000; 356 (9237): 1237, they suggested that a strong association between a non-functioning Pcom and sudden deafness using ultrasonographic doppler examination.

In this paper, the authors concluded that no link between sudden deafness and the absence of the ipsilateral Pcom using MRI/MRA examination. Their results seemed reasonable and timely, since the territory of Pcom does not involve the inner ear and the posterior cranial fossa.

Major critiques:
If non-functioning Pcom correlating with the sudden deafness, then recovery of sudden deafness should meet the functioning Pcom. Please follow up these cases to see whether hearing level compatible with the presence of Pcom.

Minor critique:
Pcom artery should be labeled on the figure.

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'