Reviewer's report

Title: Tracheal ring fracture and early tracheomalacia following percutaneous dilatational tracheostomy

Version: 1 Date: 28 June 2005

Reviewer: piero zannini

Reviewer's report:

General

The Authors report a tracheal ring fracture associated with tracheomalacia as a result of complications following a percutaneous tracheostomy procedure. While the ring fracture is clearly related to the percutaneous procedure and is a fairly frequent occurrence with no or little clinical repercussions, the tracheomalacia may be unrelated to the technique of percutaneous tracheostomy as it is usually a consequence of infection or the use of an oversized cannula or prolonged overinflation of the sealing cuff of the tracheostomy tube. However, the article warrants publication since it adds information on a relatively new technique and its potential risks, which are not dealt with extensively in the literature.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept without revision

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests. Piero Zannini, MD.